

Office of Regulatory Management

Economic Review Form

Agency name	Virginia Department of Health
Virginia Administrative Code (VAC) Chapter citation(s)	12 VAC 5-450
VAC Chapter title(s)	Rules and Regulations Governing Campgrounds
Action title	Fast-track Amendments: Temporary Campground Water Quality/Hand Washing Sinks
Date this document prepared	October 25, 2022

Table 1a: Costs and Benefits of the Proposed Changes (Primary Option)

<p>(1) Direct Costs & Benefits</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <p>This action would exempt portable hand washing sinks from the requirement that any tanks, hoses, or appurtenances that are used to distribute water shall be of food grade construction Temporary Campgrounds (12VAC5-450-187).</p> <p>Direct Costs: The only potential direct cost associated with the proposed change would be the purchasing of the signage to be required if a temporary campground uses portable hand washing sinks without food-grade water equipment. On average the sign is \$16.00.</p> <p>Direct Benefits: As hand washing is a primary component to reducing communicable disease, it is not the intention of the Virginia Department of Health to prohibit or discourage handwashing. The benefit is the allowance to use equipment that is more in line with industry standard and less burdensome to the regulant population, while protecting the public through encouraging handwashing, ensuring portable hand washing sinks meet adequate disinfection requirements, and requiring signage informing the public that water used for hand washing is not for human consumption. The use of portable hand washing sinks is not required at temporary campgrounds, however, if used, the campground operator must comply with regulatory requirements that currently restrict the water equipment to certain standards and potentially increase the cost burden to provide a public health amenity that many campground operators and patrons want or expect at a temporary campground. In the settings of temporary</p>
--	---

	<p>campgrounds, temporary hand washing sinks, when used, provide extra sanitation for campers using portable toilets, but are not used as drinking water fountains.</p> <p><u>Cost Calculation</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Average cost of portable food-grade sink: \$1,519 Number of temporary campgrounds as of September, 2022: 35 (\$1,519 * 35=\$53,165) *This is an estimate at a rate of one food-grade sink per temporary campground • Average cost of portable non food-grade sink: \$1,031.25 Number of temporary campgrounds as of September, 2022: 35 (\$1,031.25 * 35=\$36,093.75) *This is an estimate at a rate of one non food-grade sink per temporary campground • The difference in costs of portable food-grade and non-food grade sinks: \$17,071.25 yearly or \$487.75 per unit.
--	--

(2) Quantitative Factors	Estimated Dollar Amount	Present Value	
Direct Costs	(a) \$5,600 = (10 years, \$16 per sign, ~35 temp. campgrounds per year)	(c) \$4,920	
Direct Benefits	(b) \$170,713 (10 years, \$487.76 per unit, 35 temp. campgrounds)	(d) \$149,990	
(3) Benefits-Costs Ratio	30.48	(4) Net Benefit	\$145,070

(5) Indirect Costs & Benefits	<p>Indirect Costs: The agency is unable to determine possible indirect costs associated with the proposed regulatory change as the change would reduce restrictions on providing portable hand washing sinks and therefore improve and increase the ability for use at temporary campgrounds.</p> <p>Indirect Benefits: Indirect benefits include removing the burden of complying with outdated requirements that do not align with current industry practices and added clarity to operational requirements that improve campground performance and protection of the health and safety of campers and the public. In addition, campground operators and companies that supply portable sanitation facilities may save an average of</p>
-------------------------------	--

	\$488 per portable sink by not replacing existing sinks that do not meet existing regulatory requirements.																																																
(6) Information Sources	<p>Monetary value of portable hand washing sinks gathered from online research (Poly John, MOBI, Monsam, Cambro, and Regency) and industry representative outreach (Crown Verity, Satellite,) to determine food grade construction and estimated cost per unit.</p> <p>The chart below provides additional information on the various types of handwashing stations and their costs.</p> <p>”USDA” means United States Department of Agriculture “FDA” means Food and Drug Administration “NSF” means National Science Foundation</p> <table border="1"> <thead> <tr> <th>Manufacturer</th> <th>USDA Food Grade?</th> <th>FDA Food Grade?</th> <th>NSF Listed?</th> <th>Average Cost?</th> <th>Spec Sheet Provided?</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>PolyJohn</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>\$700</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Crown Verity</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Yes-NSF/ANSI-2</td> <td>\$1600</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> <tr> <td>MOBI</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>\$525</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Monsam</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>Yes</td> <td>\$2191</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Satellite</td> <td>No</td> <td>Yes-Resin Only</td> <td>Yes-Resin Only</td> <td>\$766</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Cambro</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>\$1200</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Regency</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>No</td> <td>\$1700</td> <td>Link</td> </tr> </tbody> </table>	Manufacturer	USDA Food Grade?	FDA Food Grade?	NSF Listed?	Average Cost?	Spec Sheet Provided?	PolyJohn	No	No	No	\$700	Link	Crown Verity	No	Yes	Yes-NSF/ANSI-2	\$1600	Link	MOBI	No	No	No	\$525	Link	Monsam	No	Yes	Yes	\$2191	Link	Satellite	No	Yes-Resin Only	Yes-Resin Only	\$766	Link	Cambro	No	No	No	\$1200	Link	Regency	No	No	No	\$1700	Link
Manufacturer	USDA Food Grade?	FDA Food Grade?	NSF Listed?	Average Cost?	Spec Sheet Provided?																																												
PolyJohn	No	No	No	\$700	Link																																												
Crown Verity	No	Yes	Yes-NSF/ANSI-2	\$1600	Link																																												
MOBI	No	No	No	\$525	Link																																												
Monsam	No	Yes	Yes	\$2191	Link																																												
Satellite	No	Yes-Resin Only	Yes-Resin Only	\$766	Link																																												
Cambro	No	No	No	\$1200	Link																																												
Regency	No	No	No	\$1700	Link																																												
(7) Optional	None																																																

Table 1b: Costs and Benefits under the Status Quo (No change to the regulation)

This table addresses current requirements and the implications of not making any changes. In other words, describe the costs and benefits of maintaining the current regulatory requirements as is.

<p>(1) Direct Costs & Benefits</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Current regulations for temporary campgrounds require that any tanks, hoses, or appurtenances that are used to distribute water shall be of food grade construction. <p>Direct Costs: Current industry design of the majority of portable hand washing sinks do not meet current regulatory construction requirements through standard materials and design, and may in effect discourage the use of such sinks, and thus prohibit or discourage handwashing at temporary campgrounds. The agency is unable to determine the direct monetary cost of reduced hand washing at temporary campgrounds but attests that the reduction of hand washing may jeopardize the safety, health and welfare of the public. Requiring portable hand washing sinks to be food grade would limit campground operators to select vendors, and may in effect, limit and target the market to specific providers. The ability to determine if a portable hand washing sink is of food grade construction can be difficult as various components of the sink design may be of different materials and certification, further burdening the industry on meeting compliance with the regulation.</p> <p><u>Cost Calculation</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Average cost of portable food-grade sink: \$1,519 Number of temporary campgrounds as of September, 2022: 35 (\$1,519 * 35=\$53,165) <p>*This is an estimate at a rate of one food-grade sink per temporary campground.</p> <p>Direct Benefits: The agency did not identify a direct benefit of maintaining the current regulation related to portable hand washing sinks at temporary campgrounds.</p>	
<p>(2) Quantitative Factors</p>	<p>Estimated Dollar Amount</p>	<p>Present Value</p>
<p>Direct Costs</p>	<p>(a) \$531,650 (10 yrs, \$53,165 per year)</p>	<p>(c) \$467,113</p>

Direct Benefits	(b) \$0	(d) \$0	
(3) Benefits-Costs Ratio	0	(4) Net Benefit	-\$467,113
(5) Indirect Costs & Benefits	<p>Indirect Costs: Indirect costs may include unnecessary operational burden on temporary campground operations related to portable hand washing sinks. Maintaining the status quo could result in campground operators or companies that supply portable sanitation facilities having to replace existing sinks that do not meet existing regulatory requirements.</p> <p>Indirect Benefits: No indirect benefits were identified if the regulations were retained.</p>		
(6) Information Sources	Same as Table 1.a(6)		
(7) Optional	None		

Table 1c: Costs and Benefits under an Alternative Approach

This table addresses an alternative approach to accomplishing the objectives with different requirements. These alternative approaches may include the use of reasonably available alternatives in lieu of regulation, or information disclosure requirements or performance standards instead of regulatory mandates.

(1) Direct Costs & Benefits	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● This action requires the posting of a sign to inform the public the water in a portable handwashing station is not for human consumption. One alternative to the proposed regulations to remove the requirement of signage informing the public the water in a portable hand washing station is not for human consumption. Temporary Campgrounds (12VAC5-450-187). <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Direct Costs: No direct quantitative costs were identified if the above proposed alternative is adopted. However, the consumption of water not intended for human consumption may lead to the transmission of disease, and without signage, the public may drink water from the sinks. Waterborne infection and diseases could result in significant burden on health and healthcare spending¹. ○ Direct Benefit: The average cost of a sign is \$16.00 	
(2) Quantitative Factors	Estimated Dollar Amount	Present Value

Direct Costs	(a) \$0.00	(c) \$0.00	
Direct Benefits	(b) \$5,600 = (10 years, \$16 per sign, ~35 temp. campgrounds per year)	(d) \$4,920	
(3) Benefits-Costs Ratio	\$0	(4) Net Benefit	\$4,920
(5) Indirect Costs & Benefits	<p>Indirect Costs: The agency is unable to determine any indirect cost associated with adopting the proposed alternative.</p> <p>Indirect Benefits: The agency is unable to determine any indirect benefit associated with adopting the proposed alternative.</p>		
(6) Information Sources	<p>¹Collier, Sarah A et al. "Estimate of Burden and Direct Healthcare Cost of Infectious Waterborne Disease in the United States." <i>Emerging infectious diseases</i> vol. 27,1 (2021): 140-149. doi:10.3201/eid2701.190676</p>		
(7) Optional	N/A		

Table 2: Impact on Local Partners

(1) Direct Costs & Benefits	<p>Direct Costs: Local partners or authorities such as the Virginia Restaurant, Lodging and Travel Association or Virginia Campground Association may be affected by this action in regards to notification and support to their constituents. Local and tribal governments, school divisions or other authorities are likely not affected by this action, unless they implement a local ordinance or other code specific to temporary campground facilities and portable hand washing provisions.</p> <p>Direct Benefits: No indirect benefits were identified for local partners.</p>
(2) Quantitative Factors	Estimated Dollar Amount
Direct Costs	(a) N/A
Direct Benefits	(b) N/A
(3) Indirect Costs & Benefits	<p>Indirect Costs: The agency is unable to determine any indirect cost to local partners associated with this proposed amendment.</p>

	Indirect Benefits: Potential indirect benefits to local partners associated with this proposed amendment may include improved public health protections during temporary events that involve permitted temporary campgrounds. The ability to easily provide portable hand washing sinks could improve event operations and public perception and approval through the providing of hand washing opportunities that increases public comfort and trust of an event, location, and community partners.
(4) Information Sources	N/A
(5) Assistance	N/A
(6) Optional	N/A

Table 3: Impact on Families

(1) Direct Costs & Benefits	<p>Direct Costs: The agency did not identify any direct costs to families related to the proposed amendment.</p> <p>Direct Benefits: The agency did not identify any direct benefits to families related to the proposed amendment.</p>
(2) Quantitative Factors	Estimated Dollar Amount
Direct Costs	(a) N/A
Direct Benefits	(b) N/A
(3) Indirect Costs & Benefits	<p>Indirect Costs: The agency is unable to determine the indirect cost to families regarding the proposed amendment.</p> <p>Indirect Benefits: The potential indirect benefits to families could include increased opportunities to wash hands during temporary camping events and thus improve the health and safety of the family.</p>
(4) Information Sources	N/A

(5) Optional	N/A
--------------	-----

Table 4: Impact on Small Businesses

(1) Direct Costs & Benefits	<p>Direct Costs: The agency did not identify any direct costs to small businesses related to this change.</p> <p>Direct Benefits: The direct benefits of amending the regulations to small businesses may include less regulatory burden, and therefore less potential cost to provide a public health amenity at temporary campgrounds that is often expected by the public. The agency is recommending the regulation be amended to minimize the economic impact on small businesses while maintaining appropriate regulatory standards to ensure the safety, health, and welfare of the public.</p>
(2) Quantitative Factors	Estimated Dollar Amount
Direct Costs	(a) N/A
Direct Benefits	(b) N/A
(3) Indirect Costs & Benefits	<p>Indirect Costs: The agency did not identify any indirect costs to small businesses associated with the change.</p> <p>Indirect Benefits: Indirect benefits may include the removal of unnecessary operational burden on temporary campground operations that could be reduced or removed through the proposed amendments. Amending the regulations may also reduce expenditures necessary to meet the current regulatory requirements.</p>
(4) Alternatives	<p>Alternatives to an amendment would include no action and to retain the regulation as is. As stated, this lack of change may maintain a status quo that is burdensome for the campground industry and small business. Review and consideration of amendments to the regulations is the only way for Virginia to stay current with industry standards and to ensure that the agency’s statutory requirements are executed in the least burdensome and most efficient and cost-effective manner possible while protecting the health, safety and welfare of the citizens of Virginia.</p>
(5) Information Sources	N/A

(6) Optional	N/A
--------------	-----

Changes to Number of Regulatory Requirements

For each individual VAC Chapter amended, repealed, or promulgated by this regulatory action, list (a) the initial requirement count, (b) the count of requirements that this regulatory package is adding, (c) the count of requirements that this regulatory package is reducing, (d) the net change in the number of requirements. This count should be based upon the text as written when this stage was presented for executive branch review. Five rows have been provided, add or delete rows as needed.

Table 5: Total Number of Requirements

	Number of Requirements			
Chapter number	Initial Count	Additions	Subtractions	Net Change
450	0	1	1	0